

## **Analysis of the Quality Evaluation Standard of Labor Relations of Private Small and Medium-sized Enterprises**

### **--Based on the Perspective of Decent Work**

Lin Li, Jingyan Zhang, Mingsheng Shao and Zan Guo

School of Management, Hebei University, Baoding 071002, China.

#### **Abstract**

**"Decent work" requires workers to be adequately paid at work, adequate labor protection and adequate development opportunities, is an important goal of the development of the labour market in the 21st century. Based on the understanding of decent work, this paper puts forward the connotation of the quality of labor relations from many dimensions, and according to the characteristics of china's private small and medium-sized enterprises and the current situation of labor relations development, the paper formulates the quantitative evaluation standard and system of the quality of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises, and analyzes the quality of labor relations between private small and medium-sized enterprises in China by means of field investigation and fuzzy level analysis methods. In this paper, from the perspective of improving the quality of labor process, enhancing the protection of workers' rights and interests, strengthening the construction of employee compensation and welfare system, increasing employee promotion opportunities through training, realizing employees' interest in work and corporate culture identity, this paper puts forward the countermeasures to improve the quality of labor relations between private small and medium-sized enterprises in China, so as to improve workers' job satisfaction and achieve decent employment.**

#### **Keywords**

**Decent Work; Private Small and Medium-size Enterprises; Quality of Labor Relations.**

#### **1. Introduction**

Labor relations are one of the most basic social relations, and the harmony of labor relations is the basis of social harmony. At the 87th International Labour Conference, held in June 1999, the International Labour Organization discussed the decent work report submitted by Juan Somavia, which stated that the international community wanted to give the economy a "human face" and had made the promotion of decent and more secure work the main objective. Under the background of the current economic globalization, it is necessary for the government to strengthen the protection of labor rights, promote employment and construct the mechanism of social dialogue through the implementation of macro-policies in order to realize the harmonious development of social economy between "equity and efficiency" and "control and freedom". Therefore, the current realization of "decent work" is becoming the consensus of the international community, but also become the new economic normal of our Government's important responsibility.

In April 2015, the Opinions on Building Harmonious Labor Relations were promulgated, which pointed out that the establishment of harmonious labor relations is the basis for ensuring economic development and an important part of improving people's livelihood and strengthening social management. Harmonious labor relations are high-quality labor relations, especially in the current situation that China's private small and medium-sized enterprises have become an important sector to absorb employment groups, how to scientifically evaluate the quality of labor relations according to the characteristics of private enterprises, to achieve higher quality employment of workers, has become the key to the success of the construction of a harmonious society in China. Based on the connotation of decent labor, this paper puts forward the concept of the quality of labor relations, puts forward its labor relations quality evaluation index system for the characteristics of private small and

medium-sized enterprises, and draws countermeasures to improve the quality of labor relations through field research and empirical analysis.

## **2. Literature review and commentary**

### **2.1 The definition of labour relations.**

Since the 21st century, with the rapid economic growth, changes in the working environment, the development of the human rights movement and the impact of the economic crisis and other external environmental changes, as well as enterprise human resources management, organizational behavior practices continue to deepen, the conflict between workers and capital owners has also changed the center of conflict, labor relations conflict is facing new challenges. With regard to the definition of labor relations, there are some differences between different countries and regions. Regardless of the title, the quality of labor relations in general contains the nature of labor relations and the characteristics of labor relations. From Marx's point of view, labor relations refer to the exploitation and exploitation relationship based on the private ownership of means of production, and he thinks that the positions and classes of both sides of labor relations are opposite. On the contrary, FOX (2006) believes that there is a consistency of interests between the subjects of labor relations, not a completely contradictory relationship, and he believes that in essence the relationship between the two sides is a harmonious relationship, the overall goal is the same. In the study of this problem by Chinese scholars, some scholars analyze labor relations from a macro perspective: it is considered that labor relations(laborers) are included in the social relations related to labor, and are also the general name of the social relations system related to labor process (Changkai, 2005), as well as the social and economic relations between workers and their employers and organizations (Yang Chengxiang, 2019). Some scholars analyze from the micro perspective that labor relations are the relationship between employers (business owners) and employees (workers) in employment relations, or in the actual labor production process, and the performance of labor relations can include cooperation, conflict, confrontation and other forms of change, which is caused by the change of the relationship between the main body of labor relations, is dynamic (Cheng Yanyuan, 2007), and the existence and operation of labor relations have a certain spatial scope, That is, all the labor problems formed in the workplace should be included in the research category of labor relations (Tang Kuang, 2016). In addition, with the current development of new Internet technology, the attributes of labor relations have changed, both have independent labor relations and reflect the employed labor relations, while atypical labor relations have emerged in large numbers (Wei Yihua, Zhang Shuang, 2019), this atypical labor relations between civil labor relations and standard labor relations, employment patterns are more complex, which has become a harmonious labor relations must be considered in the construction (Zhang Sufeng, 2019). Therefore, at present, we must pay attention to the definition of the connotation of labor relations, not only to summarize the core of traditional labor relations, but also pay attention to the changes in the connotation of labor relations in the new period, especially the changes in atypical labor relations, and thus reflect the development of labor relations in the times.

### **2.2 The evaluation criteria and influencing factors of labor relations.**

In terms of the factors influencing labour relations: Japan uses non-lifetime employment and performance-based salary system to replace the previous lifetime employment and annual sequential salary system in order to improve work efficiency. Such a salary distribution system affects the stability of labor relations (Ogoshi, 2006). In addition, the provisions of the Labour Code with regard to remuneration and benefits affect to some extent the right of workers to choose, and may also affect the stability of labour relations (Bartolo, 2009). In the evaluation of labor relations: Aloysius (2008) from the perspective of transnational corporations, think that the labor relations of transnational corporations in developed and developing countries are different, developing countries have their own labor relations system, multinational companies should pay attention to the balance of labor relations when implementing overseas subsidiaries, in the evaluation of labor relations need to comprehensively consider the employment system, policy impact, labor relations characteristics and so on, with scientific dynamic standards to evaluate labor relations. In analyzing the current situation

of labor relations in Shanghai enterprises, He Sheng (2007), a Chinese scholar, puts forward the evaluation index of labor environment, realization of rights, income security and skill development. Zuo Jing, Wang Decai and others (2018) in the evaluation of labor relations, the construction of 4 primary indicators, 10 secondary indicators and 29 tertiary indicators of harmonious labor relations evaluation index system, the use of factor analysis variance contribution rate to determine the weight of each indicator, from the perspective of partnership, through the empirical analysis of 328 enterprises that have established trade unions, to a certain extent, it reflects the labor relations of these enterprises. Therefore, in terms of labor relations evaluation standard, need according to the different types of enterprises labor relations for different regions, especially considering the new content change of labor relations, to build different enterprise groups of labor relations evaluation standard and index system, then refine solutions of different kinds of problems of the Labour relations in different groups.

### **2.3 Improving the management level of labor relations and building harmonious labor relations**

In improving the management level of labor relations and constructing harmonious labor relations, many scholars put forward the importance of workers' voice to labor relations, and the strong demand for workers to express their will to affect the harmony of labor relations in enterprises (Bruce E. Kaufman, 2014), which requires strengthening the construction of trade unions, fully and independently exerting the functions and roles of trade union rights protection, and thus coordinating labor relations (Xu Jian, 2017; Wang Yajing, Zhou Brigadejun, 2019). Where trade unions are unable to fully function and the economic environment deteriorates, labour relations can be improved by increasing employee participation and improving corporate governance (Davis, Lansbury, 1996). In addition, a sound legal system is an important prerequisite and guarantee for the harmonious labor relations (care, 2007), improving the management level of labor relations requires perfecting the collective bargaining system within the legal framework (Wu Qingjun, 2012), realizing the substantive fairness of labor relations from the way of relationship unity and fairness (Ye Xiaolan, 2018), establishing a reasonable coordination mechanism for labor relations, and gradually forming "labor relations with Chinese characteristics" (Chang Kai, 2017). When the labor relationship appears disharmonious and needs to be repaired, it is necessary to put forward reasonable solutions from the point of view of the diversity of workers' demand, from the point of view of the protection of workers' rights and interests, and improve workers' satisfaction with the labor process. Therefore, from the research of scholars at home and abroad, it is found that in the construction of harmonious labor relations, we need not only to start from the aspects of trade union construction, perfect laws and regulations and labor relations coordination mechanism, but also need to combine the diversity needs of workers in the new period, fully take into account the changes in the connotation of the new type of labor relations, so as to formulate the criteria for the evaluation of labor relations and find a way to achieve harmonious labor relations.

## **3. The understanding of the quality of labor relations from the perspective of decent work**

### **3.1 The definition of decent work by the International Labour Organization**

In 1999, the International Labour Organization first introduced the concept of "decent work" and stated that decent work was designed to safeguard the rights and interests of workers and to protect their dignity. The belief that "decent work" means, first, that there are sufficient jobs in society to achieve employment without sacrificing the rights of individuals, and secondly, that workers have a corresponding income and appropriate social protection measures when they engage in productive labour. In referring to "decent work", the International Labour Organization has addressed a number of aspects of the quality of labour relations, including labour protection, employment opportunities, labour rights, labour negotiations, labour contracts, remuneration and so on. The International Labour Organization's "decent work" is to ensure that workers at large work in conditions of freedom, justice, security and dignity by promoting employment, strengthening social security, safeguarding the basic

rights and interests of workers and conducting a tripartite consultation and dialogue between the Government, business organizations and trade unions. It reflects a broad social labor relationship, which is not a purely economic interest relationship, it is a culture that reflects the labor status, labor behavior and values embodied within and outside the organization, between the organization and the employees. Compliance with ILO standards for decent work can be measured by the following indicators.

### **3.2 The understanding of the quality of labor relations in this paper**

The quality of labor relations is a comprehensive evaluation category, which not only relates to the relationship between the two sides of the main body of labor relations, but also reflects the status of workers and the construction of social dialogue mechanism. From a macro point of view: labor contract signing rate, labor dispute settlement rate, social insurance participation rate, trade union participation rate and other macro indicators can reflect to a certain extent the quality of labor relations in the region in a certain period of time, from a micro point of view, workers on their current working environment, pay and benefits status, the satisfaction of protection of rights can also reflect the quality of labor relations in different periods. In general, the quality of labor relations can be understood in the following ways:

From the perspective of the main body of labor relations, the quality of labor relations: the key point lies in the ability to achieve equality between the two sides of labor relations. The realization of labor value needs to rely on the power of capital, capital to play a greater value needs the participation of labor force, there is a relationship between the two. Labor property rights are difficult to exist independently and create value, but can not think of labor force as a vassal of capital, in the process of labor production, the status of labor and capital should be equal, this equality is mainly reflected through the system, compensation, negotiation and other ways.

View the quality of labor relations from the labor and employment environment: the basic requirement to protect workers' work rights and interests is to meet their physical and mental health requirements. Safety and health in the workplace are related to the physical and mental health of employees. Especially in geology, coal mines and offshore operations and other related industries, it is necessary to protect the safety of workers and physical and mental health, which is also the company to ensure the basic working conditions of employees the most basic requirements. In addition, the prevention of occupational diseases and the protection of workers in certain industries is also a very important issue.

From the point of view of enterprise employee welfare and social security, the quality of employment and labor relations: the coverage of social security, the incentive effect of enterprise employee welfare to a certain extent reflects the employer's implementation of national laws and regulations and related policies, it is also the embodiment of enterprise value culture, is an important embodiment of the protection of workers' rights and interests.

From the employee's job satisfaction to the quality of labor relations: the factors affecting the quality of labor relations should include employment rights (right availability and equidistance), labor remuneration, job stability, personal development prospects, the degree of participation in trade unions, the degree of democratic participation in enterprise management, and the relationship with leading colleagues.

From the normative point of view of labor relations quality: in the process of using and managing labor force, labor hirers should be managed within the scope of labor law or related laws, and the rate of labor contract signing and the degree of standardized management of labor relations have become important evaluation criteria. This is the basic embodiment of freedom and equality in the labor process, so the state should strengthen the workers' freedom and equality and other aspects of the standardization of supervision, fully protect the freedom and equality of workers and legitimate rights and interests, to ensure that both sides in accordance with the law and social ethics norms. Therefore, the standardization of employment relations in the labor process has become another manifestation of high-quality labor relations.

### 3.3 The relationship between decent work and the quality of labour relations

From the understanding of the quality of decent work and labor relations, there is a close relationship between the two. Broadly speaking, "decent work" involves both the quality of employment and the quality of labour relations, that is, the state of "decent work" of workers, and the ways and means to improve the quality of labour relations. In a narrow sense, "decent work" directly reflects the quality of labor relations to a certain extent, while the degree of "decent work" is the quality level of labor relations, and decent work to some extent reflects high-quality and other labor relations. Thus, decent work means a higher level of employment in terms of the worker himself, and in terms of the relationship between employers and employees, it also means a higher quality labour relationship. Because "decent work" emphasizes the protection of the legitimate rights and interests of workers, if the legitimate rights and interests of workers can not be effectively protected, it will affect the workers' dissatisfaction with the labor itself or the employer or even society. Therefore, we can make a comprehensive understanding of the satisfaction of the protection of workers' own rights and interests through the evaluation of the quality of labor relations. The higher the quality of labour relations, the more conducive to the realization of "decent work". In 2017, the report of the 19th National Congress of the Communist Party of China mentioned that improving the quality of employment of workers requires improving the consultation and coordination mechanism in which the government, trade unions and enterprises participate and build harmonious labor relations. The construction of harmonious labor relations involves many subjects, how to deal with the relationship between the various subjects, especially the relationship between workers and employers, has become the focus of building harmonious labor relations. It can be seen that the quality of labor relations is the key link to achieve "decent work" and the important content of "decent work".

## 4. The quality evaluation system of labor relations between private small and medium-sized enterprises in China under the perspective of decent work

The quality of labor relations is a multi-dimensional concept, the establishment of labor relations quality evaluation system not only needs to accurately understand the evaluation object, but also needs to carry out a comprehensive grasp of different types of organizations, according to the characteristics of different types of organizations and the needs of different groups to develop suitable for China's private small and medium-sized enterprises labor relations quality evaluation system.

Table 1. The quality evaluation criteria and content of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises

standard	The specific content
Quality standards for labor processes	Working hours
	Labor intensity
	The working environment
Standards for the protection of labor rights and interests	The standardization of labor contracts
	The construction of trade unions is standardized
	Results of the handling of labor disputes
	The construction of consultation and negotiation mechanism
Compensation criteria	Wage income
	The time of payment of wages
Social insurance and welfare standards	The construction of the statutory insurance system
	The statutory leave system is implemented
	Facility welfare construction
	Incentive welfare system construction
Career development standards	The construction of the vocational training system
	Career promotion path construction
	Career development matches interests
Psychological standards	Work is recognized
	Corporate cultural identity



#### **4.1 The design of the quality evaluation index system of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises**

The Key Indicators of the Labour Market (KILM), designed by the International Labour Organization (ILO), contains 17 labour market "key" indicators that provide a more comprehensive picture and measurement of labour market development and provide a solid basis for research into decent work and labour relations assessments. Based on the KILM index system and the understanding of the quality of decent labor and labor relations, this study selects some of the quality evaluation index systems of labor relations in line with the actual situation of china's private small and medium-sized enterprises, including labor process quality, labor rights and interests protection, compensation, social insurance and welfare, career development and psychological standards. In addition, in order to facilitate the use of AHP and other methods to analyze and build a set of factors, this paper in the first-level index system under the construction of the second-level indicator system, to adapt to the analysis of specific evaluation factors. As this paper mainly focuses on the manufacturing of private small and medium-sized enterprises research, so this article on the basis of the International Labour Organization on decent work, taking into account the development of labor relations with Chinese characteristics, fully combined with the relevant laws and regulations in China and the characteristics of private small and medium-sized enterprises in the manufacturing industry, the formulation of evaluation standards and content. As shown in Table 1.

#### **4.2 The selection basis and internal relationship of the quality index of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises**

The quality standards of labor process, salary standards and social security and welfare standards are to strengthen social protection. (1) The quality standards and remuneration standards of labor process mainly involve labor time, labor intensity, working environment and income, which are highlighted in income and occupational diseases. For example, the emergence of social hot issues such as "unpaid wages" and "salary collection" are such problems. For workers, the quality of labor relations will be directly affected if they are not properly paid for their work or engaged in hazardous work without proper protection. Compared with state-owned enterprises and large enterprises, private small and medium-sized enterprises owe workers relatively more wages, which seriously harms the personal interests of workers, but also not conducive to the stable development of labor relations. (2) Social security and welfare standards are compensation and protection for the risks that workers may encounter on the basis of the quality of work. If more protection is provided for the risks that workers may encounter, it means that the vital interests of workers are concerned and the quality of labor relations will be further improved. Conversely, failure to provide social insurance, rest systems and welfare benefits will have a negative impact on the reproduction of labour. Generally speaking, private small and medium-sized enterprises are prone to this kind of phenomenon. Therefore, it is necessary to strengthen the protection of work safety, improve the treatment and welfare of work for the improvement of labor relations.

The standard of protection of labor rights and interests promotes social harmony. The International Labour Organization believes that dialogue with workers should be strengthened, the voice of workers should be heard, and the problems they face can be solved from the perspective of workers. It is also a way to fundamentally improve labor relations. However, in the actual development of private small and medium-sized enterprise workers is the lack of such opportunities and equal response platform. This phenomenon, on the one hand, may be caused by the lack of self-protection consciousness of workers, on the other hand, it is caused by the imperfection of the system. Therefore, the investigation of labor rights and interests protection standards is particularly important.

The interaction between professional development standards and psychological standards is the goal of the development of high-quality labor relations. (1) Career development prospects are related to the realization of personal value and the satisfaction of needs. In the process of examining the quality of labor relations, in addition to the necessary material needs, we should pay attention to the satisfaction of the psychological needs of labor force. A two-pronged effort can effectively improve the quality of labor relations. (2) Psychological standards are also an important measure of the quality

of labor relations and job satisfaction. According to Maslow's theory of demand level, workers will pursue "respect demand" and "self-fulfillment demand" more after meeting the needs of lower levels. Therefore, we must pay attention to the psychological feelings of the labor force. In the private small and medium-sized enterprises, ordinary workers are often not high-level elite class, with the development of society, they are more demanding to achieve higher demand.

## 5. Empirical analysis of the quality of labor relations between private smes

According to the above-mentioned labor relations quality evaluation index system, select the representative manufacturing private small and medium-sized enterprises in different regions of Hebei Province to conduct research, and apply the data to the evaluation index system, and use the fuzzy level analysis method to analyze and study the quality of labor relations between private small and medium-sized enterprises.

### 5.1 Data sources and description statistics

Based on the characteristics of Hebei's economic structure, this paper selects representative private small and medium-sized manufacturing enterprises from various regions to conduct investigations, involving ferrous metal smelting and rolling processing industry, paper and paper products industry, biochemistry and pharmaceutical manufacturing industry, food manufacturing and auto parts manufacturing industry, which contribute a lot to the economy of Hebei Province and have a large number of employed people, and these industries can reflect the employment and labor relations quality of private small and medium-sized enterprise workers to a certain extent. In the course of investigation, first listen to the company responsible for the business management of the introduction, and then in-depth workshop or grass-roots level, on-the-spot inspection of the labor situation of workers, individual interviews. The persons under investigation are workers working in various enterprises. This questionnaire issued a total of 400 copies, regardless of name, on the spot all recycled, excluding incomplete answers, the valid questionnaire for 223. The scope of the investigation involves 3 units in Shijiazhuang City, Hebei Province, 2 units in Baoding City, 2 units in Tangshan City, 2 units in Handan City, 1 unit in Cangzhou City and 1 unit in Zhangjiakou City.

### 5.2 Evaluation of the quality satisfaction of labor relations based on fuzzy hierarchy analysis methods

The quality of labor relations is a multi-dimensional concept, and this paper makes a comprehensive evaluation of the quality satisfaction of labor relations of small and medium-sized enterprises from a multi-dimensional point of view. The specific analysis steps are as follows:

#### 5.2.1. Establish a set of evaluation factors

In terms of factor setting, the set of factors built using the hierarchical method is  $U = \{U1, U2, U3, U4, U5, U6\}$ . In this paper, the labor relations quality evaluation index system is set into three levels, namely: first-level indicator A, second-level indicator B, third-level indicator C. Primary indicator A indicates the overall satisfaction of the quality of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises, second-level indicator B indicates the secondary influencing factors of labor relations quality, and third-level indicator C indicates the specific influencing factors under the secondary index.

The secondary indicators can be divided into 6 dimensions for analysis, namely: labor process quality standard B1, labor rights and interests protection standard B2, salary standard B3, social security and welfare standard B4, employee career development standard B5, work psychology standard B6.

Three levels of indicators can be divided into 18 dimensions for specific analysis. In the labor process quality standard B1 can be divided into labor time C1, labor intensity C2, working environment C3, labor rights and interests protection standard B2 can be divided into labor contract standardization C4, trade union construction standardization C5, consultation and negotiation mechanism C6, labor dispute handling C7, salary standard B3 can be divided into income level C8, payment time C9, social security and welfare standard B4 can be divided into statutory insurance construction satisfaction C10, statutory leave system satisfaction C11, Facility welfare construction satisfaction C12, incentive

welfare construction satisfaction C13; social security and welfare standard B4 can be divided into statutory insurance construction satisfaction C10, statutory leave system satisfaction C11, facility welfare construction satisfaction C12, incentive welfare construction satisfaction C13; Staff career development standard B5 can be divided into vocational training system construction satisfaction C14, career promotion path satisfaction C15, career development and interest matching C16; The work psychology standard B6 can be divided into work identity C17, corporate culture identity C18.

**5.2.2. Establish a review set**

In terms of evaluation criteria, the five-level scoring method is used to construct a review set of  $V=\{V_1, V_2, V_3, V_4, V_5\}$ , that is, the satisfaction rating is divided into five levels of very satisfied, satisfied, general, dissatisfied and completely dissatisfied, that is, the comment set is {more satisfied, satisfied, general, dissatisfied, very dissatisfied}.

**5.2.3. Weight allocation**

In determining the weight coefficient of the matrix, the weight of the influencing factors is determined by expert opinion method. Therefore, it is necessary to construct a comparison matrix, that is, the weighting coefficient (matrix A-B) of the B-layer indicator to the A-layer indicator and the weight coefficient of the C-layer indicator to the B-layer indicator (matrix B-C). In this process, pair comparison method and 1-9 comparison scale are used to create a pair of comparison arrays, and through the consistency test. In the weight setting fully consider the current situation of private small and medium-sized enterprises, such as salary level and on-time payment, social insurance coverage, working hours, labor contract standardization, etc. are still the outstanding problems of the current private small and medium-sized enterprises, the weight setting increased the ratio; However, with the improvement of the operation status of china's private small and medium-sized enterprises and the development of the quality of labor relations, evaluation indicators and weights will be adjusted.

**5.2.4. Comprehensive evaluation analysis**

According to the subordination matrix of each index, the evaluation matrix and weight are synthesized and further normalized to arrive at the evaluation value. As shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Total ranking and membership relationship of each evaluation index level

First level indicators	Second indicators	weight	Third level indicators	weight	Subordinate relations
Small and medium-sized enterprise labor relations quality evaluation system A	Quality standards for labor processes B1	0.217	Working hours C1	0.637	0.06,0.62,0.23,0.07,0.02
			Labor intensity C2	0.258	0.07,0.32,0.57,0.03,0.01
			The working environment C3	0.105	0.02,0.09,0.70,0.16,0.03
	Standards for the protection of labor rights and interests B2	0.066	The standardization of labor contracts C4	0.500	0.13,0.28,0.47,0.07,0.05
			The construction of trade unions is standardized C5	0.066	0.10,0.22,0.43,0.17,0.08
			Results of the handling of labor disputes C6	0.147	0.13,0.21,0.52,0.10,0.04
			The construction of consultation and negotiation mechanism C7	0.288	0.12,0.17,0.49,0.15,0.07
	Compensation criteria B3	0.471	Wage income C8	0.750	0.10,0.18,0.51,0.15,0.06
			The time of payment of wages C9	0.250	0.11,0.20,0.47,0.17,0.05
	Social insurance and welfare standards B4	0.150	The construction of the statutory insurance system C10	0.578	0.18,0.23,0.42,0.11,0.06
			The statutory leave system is implemented C11	0.238	0.04,0.14,0.38,0.27,0.17
			Facility welfare construction C12	0.121	0.07,0.15,0.56,0.15,0.07
			Incentive welfare system construction C13	0.064	0.11,0.18,0.37,0.23,0.11
	Career development standards B5	0.056	The construction of the vocational training system C14	0.637	0.02,0.09,0.62,0.18,0.09
			Career promotion path construction C15	0.258	0.08,0.17,0.49,0.16,0.10
			Career development matches interests C16	0.105	0.12,0.16,0.52,0.11,0.09
	Psychological standards B6	0.040	Work is recognized C17	0.750	0.12,0.17,0.47,0.13,0.11
			Corporate cultural identity C18	0.250	0.13,0.16,0.53,0.11,0.07

Based on the table and table data, the second-level indicators are evaluated in a fuzzy and comprehensive manner, and the calculation process is as follows:



According to the evaluation value calculated above, the comprehensive evaluation of various factors and indicators is carried out by using the five-level segmentation method. In this paper, the evaluation set is assigned a value of 100 points for satisfaction, 80 points for satisfaction, 60 points for general, 40 points for dissatisfaction, and 20 points for dissatisfaction. Available based on its weights:

The comprehensive evaluation score of labor process quality standard B1 is:

$$B1=0.065*100+0.572*80+0.238*60+0.097*40+0.028*20=70.98$$

The comprehensive evaluation score of the standard B2 for the protection of labor rights and interests is as:

$$B2=0.118*100+0.255*80+0.427*60+0.136*40+0.064*20=70.74$$

The salary standard B3 comprehensive evaluation score is:

$$B3=0.105*100+0.190*80+0.486*60+0.162*40+0.057*20=62.48$$

The comprehensive evaluation score of social insurance and welfare standard B4 is:

$$B4=0.145*100+0.186*80+0.339*60+0.192*40+0.137*20=60.14$$

The employee career development standard B5 comprehensive evaluation score is:

$$B5=0.089*100+0.145*80+0.528*60+0.153*40+0.085*20=60$$

The overall evaluation score of work psychology standard B6 is:

$$B6=0.129*100+0.168*80+0.465*60+0.129*40+0.109*20=61.58$$

According to the comprehensive score of the above two levels of indicators, the comprehensive evaluation score of all factors is in a "general" state. At the same time, according to the comprehensive weight of the two-tier index can calculate the overall satisfaction A score of the quality of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises, that is:

$$A=70.98*0.217+70.74*0.066+62.48*0.471+60.14*0.150+60*0.056+61.58*0.040=64.34$$

According to the calculation results, the quality satisfaction score of labor relations of workers in private small and medium-sized enterprises in Hebei Province was 64.34, which was in a "general" state. However, from the evaluation criteria of various indicators, the labor process quality standards and labor rights and interests protection standards scored more than 70 points, indicating that private small and medium-sized enterprises in labor time, labor intensity, working environment, labor contract standardization, trade union construction standardization, consultation and negotiation mechanism, labor dispute handling and other aspects have been improved, reflecting in strengthening the legal system and promoting the construction of harmonious labor relations, the quality of labor relations has improved. From the salary standard, social insurance and welfare standard, employee career development standard and work psychology standard score, the score is low, indicating that the private small and medium-sized enterprises still have a lower level of pay, social insurance (especially unemployment insurance and work injury insurance) coverage is limited, personal career development and work identity is low, these indicators lower the overall quality of labor relations of private small and medium-sized enterprises, but also China's future promotion of higher-quality employment, to achieve harmonious labor relations development of important areas.

## 6. The conclusion of enlightenment

1. From the point of view of the quality standards of the labor process of workers in private small and medium-sized enterprises, workers have improved in terms of working hours, labor intensity and working environment, scoring above 70 points, but further improvement is still needed. According to China's "Regulations on the Working Hours of Workers" and other relevant laws and regulations, workers work 8 hours a day and 40 hours a week. Nationally, the average weekly work time for urban manufacturing workers in China in 2018 is 48 hours, two hours higher than in the United States in the 1940s (data from China Industry Information Network). And the current enterprise overtime time is long, labor intensity and other issues in the performance of private small and medium-sized enterprises more common. Therefore, China's private small and medium-sized enterprises need to further implement the relevant laws and regulations, in shortening labor hours, reduce labor intensity, improve the working environment and other aspects to improve the quality of labor processes, so as to further improve the quality of labor relations. In terms of working hours, we shall abide by the Regulations on the Working Hours of Employees, adhere to the standard eight-hour working days, formulate a scientific and reasonable overtime system and measures for the management of overtime pay; In the aspect of labor intensity, according to the nature of the job and the "physical labor intensity classification (GB3869-1997)" to determine the labor intensity of different positions; In terms of working environment, the enterprise shall provide a safe and clean working environment for its workers, create necessary protective conditions and provide necessary protective facilities.

2. From the point of view of the standard of labor rights and interests protection for workers of private small and medium-sized enterprises, enterprises have made certain achievements in the standardization of labor contracts, the standardization of trade union construction, the mechanism of consultation and negotiation, and the handling of labor disputes. In recent years, China has improved both in terms of labor contract signing rate and labor dispute settlement rate. This can also be confirmed by some data. For example, in 2018, the number of grass-roots trade union organizations in China reached 2.809 million (data source: report on the work of the 17th National Congress of the National Federation of Trade Unions in 2018), and trade unions played a role in the protection of labor rights. In 2018, China's labor and personnel dispute mediation and arbitration institutions handled a total of 1.826 million disputes, the success rate of mediation of cases was 68.7%, the arbitration settlement rate of 95.1% (data source: 2018 human resources and social security

development statistics bulletin), labor dispute processing capacity further improved, therefore, the survey of private small and medium-sized enterprises labor rights and interests protection standards score of 70.74 points, according to the five-level rating rating as "satisfactory." In the future, we need to further standardize the management of labor contracts, strengthen the construction of trade union rights, improve the mechanism of consultation and negotiation, etc. to enhance the level of employment security for workers of private small and medium-sized enterprises. In terms of the standardization of labor relations management, we should continue to adhere to the provisions of the Labor Contract Law, the National Standards for labor contract norms and other relevant laws and regulations, standardize the content and form of labor contracts, avoid the hollowing out of labor contracts, and truly make labor contracts become the basis for workers' rights; To continue to strengthen the construction of trade unions of private small and medium-sized enterprises, in addition to continuing to strengthen the function of trade union rights protection, it is necessary to develop the service function of trade unions according to the characteristics of the development of private small and medium-sized enterprises and new labor relations, to provide professional guidance and rights protection consulting services for employees of private small and medium-sized enterprises, and to improve the job satisfaction of workers. In addition, with the improvement of trade union functions, the consultation and negotiation mechanism and dispute handling mechanism of private small and medium-sized enterprises can really be established and perfected.

3. From the point of view of salary standard, the wage income satisfaction of private small and medium-sized enterprise workers still needs to be improved, according to the survey and empirical analysis, the index score is only 62.48, the score is not high. In order to achieve decent work, the first priority is to raise the income level of workers, in addition to the general wage remuneration, but also can increase the corresponding number of bonuses, allowances and so on. At present, private small and medium-sized enterprises need to further optimize the current income distribution system, increase the income of workers in the initial distribution, not only to raise the wage level, but also to strengthen the salary incentive, improve the income level of workers. Labor inspection departments need to further strengthen the management of some private small and medium-sized enterprises, reduce the phenomenon of wage arrears, to protect the rights and interests of workers.

4. From the point of view of social insurance and welfare standards, the empirical analysis score of this indicator is only 60.14, indicating that private small and medium-sized enterprise workers have low social insurance coverage and employee benefits need to be strengthened. Social insurance projects as statutory benefits, old-age pension and medical insurance system with the promotion of social security full coverage policy objectives, coverage rapidly expanded, but industrial injury insurance, unemployment insurance and other projects to achieve the goal of full coverage is still a long time, especially private small and medium-sized enterprises workers due to strong mobility and other reasons, unemployment insurance and work injury insurance and other projects to improve the participation rate. From the point of view of other welfare projects, employee welfare is mainly based on the profitability of enterprises, private small and medium-sized enterprise workers to obtain other benefits relative to large state-owned enterprises, especially enterprise annuities, supplementary insurance, paid leave, facilities benefits, incentive benefits and other system construction still need to be further built and perfected, which is also the basis for private small and medium-sized enterprises to retain talent and grow and develop. In the future, private small and medium-sized enterprises also need to analyze the relationship between the increase of welfare cost and the economic benefits of enterprises, realize the match between welfare expenditure and benefit growth, and realize enterprise development on the basis of improving employee welfare.

5. From the point of view of career development standards, the development path of private SMEs is limited. In this survey and analysis, the satisfaction score of workers in career development is 60 points, which is the "unsatisfactory" warning line of labor relations. This shows that career development is the main factor affecting the quality of labor relations. From the point of view of human capital, scholars believe that the investment of human capital can improve the performance of enterprises and help to build harmonious labor relations. From the point of view of demand level

theory, workers will certainly pursue a higher level of "respect demand" and "self-realization needs" after meeting basic needs. Therefore, governments and enterprises need to further strengthen training so that workers can further improve and promote the opportunities. More human capital investment is conducive to further improve the vocational skills of workers, can enable employees to create value for enterprises on the basis of improving their own development capacity and income level, help to build harmonious labor relations, improve the quality of labor relations.

6. From the psychological standards of work, private small and medium-sized enterprise employees on the corporate culture and the recognition of their own values still need to be strengthened. Enterprise managers should realize that enterprises and employees are symbiotic, win-win and co-long relationship, only the enterprise is responsible to employees, employees will be responsible for the enterprise. Enterprises need to mobilize and exert the enthusiasm and creativity of employees through various incentives, and give employees a sense of trust and belonging, in order to effectively promote the quality of labor relations. At the same time, enterprises should pay attention to enterprise positioning and corporate image shaping, good corporate image and enterprise influence, will help workers psychological satisfaction. The government should also correct the incorrect view of employment and job choice from the perspective of people's cognition, so that people realize the value of any job in particular, and workers in any job should be respected.

### Acknowledgements

Hebei Province Social Development Research Project in 2020: Analysis of the quality evaluation of labor relations between private small and medium-sized enterprises (202007006).

### References

- [1] Chang Kai, 2017, The Developmental Stage, Characteristics and Trends of Labor Relations with Chinese Characteristics: From the International Comparative Labor Relations Perspective, Wuhan University Journal (Social Science),9.
- [2] Chang Kai, 2013, The Collective Transformation of Labor Relations and the Improvement of the Government's Labor Policy, Social Sciences in China,6.
- [3] Guan Huai, 2007, On Construction Of Harmonious Labour Relationship & Labour Law System, Law Science Magazine, 3.
- [4] Luo Suwen, 2019, On the Teeds of People's Better Life and the Repair of Socialist Labor, Social Sciences in Hunan, 3.
- [5] Meng Dahu, Su Lifeng and Ouyang Renfei, 2016, Construction and Evaluation of Harmonious Labor Relations Index Ssystem in China: 1991 -2014, Human Resources Development of China, 16.
- [6] Qian Fang, Chen Dongyou and Zhou Xiaogang, 2013, The Construction of the Index System for Measuring the Employment Quality of Peasant Workers,Jiangxi Social Sciences, 9.
- [7] Sun Yu and Qu Yong, 2014, Construction of Evaluation Index System of Labor Relations Satisfaction from the Perspective of Employees, Social Science Front, 9.
- [8] Wang Yajing and Zhou Lvjun, 2019, Analysis on the Trend, Influencing Factors and Consequences of Labor Union Formation in Private Enterprises: An Empirical Study Based on the Survey of Private Enterprises in China, Journal of Beijing University of Technology (Social Sciences Edition), 4.
- [9] Wei Yihua and Zhang Shuang, 2019, Labor Relations Change and Coordination Mechanism under the Background of New Scientific and Technological Revolution, Seeking Truth,3.
- [10]Wu Qingjun, 2012, Collective Consultation and the Governance of Labor Relations under State Dominance: The strategies and practice of index management, Sociological Studies, 3.
- [11]Yang Chengxiang, 2019, On the Characteristics and Trend of Labor Relations with Chinese Characteristics, Theoretical Investigation, 4.

- 
- [12] Yu Yunxia, 2001, Economic Globalization and "Decent Work", Shandong Trade Unions' Tribune, 6.
- [13] Zhang Sufeng, 2019, Orientation and Regulation of Atypical Employment Relationship in the New Era, Journal of Anhui Normal University (Hum.& Soc.Sci.), 7.
- [14] Zuo Jing, Wang Decai and Feng Juncai, 2018, An Indicator System of Harmonious Employment Relations from the Perspective of Labor-Management Partnership, Business Management Journal, 4.
- [15] Aloysius N. K., 2008, The Impact of Global Employment Models in East in A Developing Country: Industrial Relation Management in Multinational Banks in Tanzania, Intermittent Journal of Comparat Labour Law and Industrial Relations, 2:234-256.
- [16] Bartolo L. L. and Sheahan M., 2009, Industrial Relations Reform and the Occupational Transition of Australian Workers: A Critical Discourse Analysis [J]., Work Journal of Prevention Assessment and Rehabilitation, 32(4):407-415.
- [17] Bill Taylor, 2000, Trade unions and social capital in transitional communist states: The case of China, Policy Sciences, 33(3):341-354.
- [18] Bruce E. K., 2014, Explaining Breadth and Depth of Employee Voice across Firms: A Voice Factor Demand Model, Journal of Labor Research, 35(3):296-319.
- [19] Chaykowski R. P., 2002, Re-Inventing Production Systems and Industrial Relations: Technology-Driven Transformation in the Canadian Mrtal-Minine Industry, Journal of Labor Research, 2002(4): 592-609.
- [20] Godfrey B., 1999, A double dose of unitarism: employment relations in a small firm in a small island state, International Journal of Employment Studies, 7(2):103-120.
- [21] Malcolm W., 2002, Conclusion: The Future of Chinese Management, Asia Pacific Business Review, 9(2):205-223.
- [22] Ogoshi Y., 2006, Current Japanese Employment Practices and Industrial Relations: The Transformation of Permanent Employment an Seniority-Based Wage System, Asian Business and Management, 5(4):469-485.
- [23] Piore M. J. and Safford S. C., 2007, Changing Regimes of Workplace Governance, Shifting Axes of Social Mobilization, and the Challenge to Industrial Relations Theory, Human Resources Abstracts, 45(3):299-325.
- [24] Simon C, Chang-Hee L and Qi Li, 2007, Collective Consultation and Industrial Relations in China, British Journal of Industrial Relations, 42(2):235–254.
- [25] Warner M., 2002, Globalization, labour-markets and human resources in Asia-Pacific economies: an overview, International Journal of Human Resource Management, 13(3):384-98.